

*Llull's Proverbis d'ensenyament in a copy
of Hernán Núñez's Refranes, o proverbios
en romance (Salamanca, 1555) in the British Library*

BARRY TAYLOR
(The British Library)

The *Refranes, o proverbios en romance* compiled by Hernán Núñez (1475-1553), professor of Greek and rhetoric at the University of Salamanca and editor of Pliny, Seneca, Pomponius Mela, Moschus and Juan de Mena, was not the first collection of Spanish popular proverbs, but it was the most famous (ed. Combet *et al.* 2001; Madroñal 2007).

Núñez, like earlier collectors such as Pedro Vallés, included parallel proverbs in Latin, Basque, French, Italian, Catalan, Portuguese and Galician. Although it did not originate with Erasmus, this is essentially the technique of the *Adagia*. Erasmus does supply vernacular parallels to the sayings of the ancients, but he is essentially Latin: Núñez is a liminal figure between Latin and vernacular. His sources were at least in part printed, such as the work of Pedro Vallés (Madroñal 2007).

The margins of his book and spaces between lines, like others, were used by early readers to record parallel proverbs which they encountered in their reading.¹ Rosenthal (1997) shows copies of Erasmus's *Adagia* (no. 46) and Valerius Maximus (no. 149) to which further examples have been added in manuscript.

Copy 635.l.111 of Núñez's *Refranes* in the British Library is copiously annotated by at least four hands.² Of particular interest is the inclusion of a good number of the *Proverbis d'ensenyament* of Ramon Llull. The manuscript an-

1. The following copies are annotated: Buenos Aires, Biblioteca Nacional 62 rFD; Madrid, Biblioteca Histórica Municipal Par. 531 and Par. 535; Madrid, Biblioteca Nacional R/14056; Usoz 1209 (digitized); Madrid, Universidad Complutense M-UC-NOV, BH FLL 24153 (digitized).

2. It is digitized by Google Books.

notations to the BL copy are not glosses; they are all extra examples. We might note the use of Latin as a medium: ‘Vide’, ‘Italus’, ‘Gall[us]’.

PROVENANCE

One suggestion of provenance is a slip tipped in between ff. 120v and 121r which reads:

Don Juan Teres Arçobispo de Tarragona [Joan Terès i Borrull, d. 1603]
Obiit Rdus pater Berengarius de Villamulorum quodam archieps S. Eccesiae XIII.
Kal. Madii anno M.C.XCIV [Berenguer de Vilademuls, Archbishop of Tarragona,
d. 1194]

There are also some Spanish proverbs. This could be Hand 1 (see below).

This copy has been in the British Museum Library since its foundation in 1753. It bears the previous pressmarks E.91 and 3Ln; the reverse title page has the black stamp MUSEUM BRITANNICUM and in pencil 8.o.k. It belonged to Sir Hans Sloane (1660–1753), physician and secretary of the Royal Society.³ He included Spanish books in his extensive library, and used a copy of Nicolás Antonio as a selection tool (Blakeway 2011: 14–16). He had another copy of Hernán Núñez in the 1619 edition. Copy 635.l.11 has been known to scholarship since 1815: Alexander Chalmers (1815: 273), under the heading HERNÁN NÚÑEZ (p. 273) recorded, “of this edition there is a copy in the British Museum with ms notes”.

At the foot of the title page is ‘de fran\co/ [the surname is eaten away by worms]; on the last page 143v his name is complete: “este libro es de fran[cis] co/ lopez”.

Four hands, I believe, have annotated the book. I list them according to the number of proverbs they record. Although they are hard to date, I am certain that all the annotations were made to the book before Sloane acquired it.

Hand 1 heads his notes “Adagia Graeca et latina quae iis respondent” (fol. 1r) but records Latin, Spanish and Catalan parallels, a few French (f. 28r) and

3. <<http://www.bl.uk/catalogues/sloane/FullDisplay.aspx?RecordId=025-000034827&QueryID=1&Type=0>>; <<http://www.bl.uk/catalogues/sloane/>>; <<http://www.bl.uk/catalogues/sloane/FullDisplay.aspx?RecordId=025-000034827&QueryID=5&Type=0>>.

none in Greek. This is the only hand to have been cropped (e.g. 77v, 95r), which suggests it is the earliest. The ink of Hand 1 has corroded the paper. It resembles a number of hands of authors active around 1600 (Jauralde 2008). It is possibly that of Francisco López.

Hand 2 contributes many Italian proverbs (e.g. a sequence at ff. 22-25, beginning 'Chi') and some French (ff. 28r, 59r). At f. 36r Hand 2 writes around Hand 1. It seems that the same person uses different scripts for Italian and French. There is abundant evidence in the early modern period that scholars from outside Italy learned to write an Italic hand as they learned the language: Francis of Sales (Mellinghoff-Bourgeries 2011) and the Englishmen John North (Gallagher 2017) and the anonymous annotator of a copy of Baret's *Alvearie* (Koppelman and Wechsler 2015; Woudhuysen 2014).⁴

Hand 3 is also Spanish, taller than Hand 1 (ff. 22v, 28v, 67r), and seems to be earlier than Hand 2. Hand 4 (f. 30r) also contributes some Italian.

Although they occur throughout, the annotations are densest at the beginning (this seems to be the norm for manuscript annotations in printed books). A few of the later pages are untouched (the earliest is 41v), and some have only a series of ticks in the margin (e.g. f. 61v).

LATIN PROVERBS

Hand 1 marks some of his Latin quotes with 'M' or 'M. V.', which can be identified as Michael Verinus (Taylor 1999).

1r: Quod precibus vendis, pretium tibi uile uidetur:

An mihi res emitur carior ulla prece: M.

(Verino 1987: c6v; see also 1r, 2r, 2v, 5r, 8r, 10r, 11v, 12v, 14v)

Some sources marked with just an Arabic number are citations by page from Laurentius Mondanarius, *Miscellanea Disticha ad Vitae Institutionem* (Antwerp: Plantin, 1565).

1v: Discas Pythagorae prius silendo artes quam doceas bonos loquendo. 133

(Similarly ff. 5v, 8r, 8v, 9rv, 10r, 11r, 12r, 16r, 19r, 20rv 32v)

4. For Cambridge examples, see Fairbanks and Dickins (1962).

A further source of Latin tags is the *Sententiae* of Publilius Syrus Mimus, here called, as was not uncommon, Publianus (ff. 9r, 11v, 16v, 18v, 20r, 64v).

There are also unsurprisingly a number of quotations from the wisdom books of the Bible, cited by title and chapter: f. 5v: Ecclesiasti 25; f. 6r: Proverb. 15; f. 71r Ecclesiasti. XI; f. 54r.

VERNACULAR PROVERBS

Hand 1 quotes Spanish proverbs:

f. 129r: Viña, y potro, crielo otro. Vide Petrum Ferdinandez de Andrada libro 2 de la n[atur]aleza del cavallo. fol. 78.

The reference is to the first edition of 1580 (see also 21v, 23v, 35r).

Hand 1 also notes Italian proverbs paired with French:

f. 28r: [Núñez: El italiano. Assi va el mundo mezquino, sabado Griego, miercoles Latino] Ainsi va le monde meschin, samedy grec, et mercredy latin. Cosi presto muorono le piegore giouani, come le uecchie. Italus. i. tan presto mueren las ovejias moças como las uiejias. Gall. Aussi tost mourent ieunes brebis que vielles.

The source is Corrozet (1547: B1r), where the Italian and French translation appear in the same combination (similarly, f. 28v, 52v, 60r, 67v, 79r, 123r). As the Spanish does not appear in Corrozet, this makes it more likely to be Hand 1's own translation.

Hand 4 contributes Italian and some French and also likely handled Corrozet, as he writes

Qui respond pour aultruy
pour luy mesme paye
Chi per altri sta, per se paga.
(f. 102r; cf. Corrozet 14r)

RAMON LLULL

A notable feature of this volume are forty-nine proverbs in Catalan copied by Hand 1, with the identifier 'Catal. R. L.', or 'R. Lull' or 'Catal. ex. R. L.' or

similar, with a Spanish translation. The Catalan text is from the *Proverbis d'ensenyament* (Tous 2016). Tous (2018) takes account of the Catalan in his edition and shows the variants in Núñez are minor.

[1] f. 26v: Con buen pobre te acompaña y no con rico que apaña. Catal. R. L. Mais ams star ab paubre bo, que ab rich auar fals faillo. Cf. Tous 24: mes vulles esser pobre y bon / que rich a malediccion.

[2] f. 30r: Del que tu mal no reprehende no confies porque te uende. Catal. ex. Raym. Llull. Not uulles a home fiar que not reprende to mal far. Cf. Tous 21.

[3] Del que los terminos niega, en disputa te despega. Contra negantes principia non est arguendum. Catal. R. L. No uulles ab cel disputar, que tos termes uulla negar. Cf. Tous. 149. Note that there is a Latin translation as well as Spanish.

[4] f. 39r: El que no cumple y prefiere un maleuolo se adquiere. Catal. R. L. Cel qui promet et no ateyn, asi quer home mal uolen. Cf. Tous 40.

[5] f. 46v: En el beuer ten tal tino que lleues, mas no a ti el uino. Catal. R. L. Not port lo ui que tu beuras, por ta lo tu quant per la tas. Cf. Tous 171: not port lo vi que tu beurás; / porta-lo tu quant parlarás.

[6] 55v: Hazte algun angel amigo, que te sea guardia y abrigo. Catal. R. L. D'algun Angel fas ton amich, perto quet quart del enemich. Cf. Tous 30. The annotator misreads 'ço' as 'to'.

[7] Haz de grado y a plazer lo que por fuerça has de hazer. Catal. R. L. There is no Catalan. Not by Llull?

[8] f. 57v: Hombre por su cortedad se admira de infinidad. Catal. R. L. Con cascun hom sta finit, se marauilla dl infinit. Cf. Tous 103.

[9] f. 75v: Mantente a dios por amigo y riete del enemigo. Catal. R. Lul. Sols que Deu sia ton amich, en nulla te hauras destrich. Cf. Tous 13: nulla re.

[10] Mas uale cortes obrero que descortes cauallero, Catal. R. L. Caualler uila descortes no uall tant quant cortes pages. Cf. Tous 35.

[11] f. 77v: [cropped at top] Mientras estas en pecado, [...] ya no podras hauer ualor, de mentre sies peccador. Cf. Tous 125.

[12] f. 81v: Ni busques fuego en fontana, ni castidad en putana. Catal. R. L. No cerci lo foch en la fontana, ne castedad en la putana. Cf. Tous 108.

[13] f. 84v: No te metas en prision do no se guarda razon. Catal. R. L. Guardet no entres en preso, on no esta dret ne rasio. Cf. Tous 129: Guardet no entres en presó / hon no está dret ni rahó.

[14] No hagas viage seguido con hombre no conocido. Catal. R. L. Si vas ab hom allonga via, sapias aquell hom e qual sia. Cf. Tous 132.

[15] No quieras bolver la cara al que em [sic] razon te habla. Catal. R. L. No vulles a home fugir, que ab rao te vol seguir. Cf. Tous 135.

- [16] No te comas tu capon a hurtadas como gloton. Catal. R. L. No vulles manjar ton capó, com a layron, ni a gloton. *Cf.* Tous 170.
- [17] No seas a nadie importuno por lo que es de util ninguno. Catal. R. L. No vulles a home demanar de lo que not pot profiter. *Cf.* Tous 19.
- [18] No quieras ser mas honrado de lo que requiere tu peccado. Catal. R. L. No vulles esser mais honrat que no pertain per ton peccat. *Cf.* Tous 27.
- [19] No gastes tiempo en querer lo que no puedes haver. Catal. R. L. No ames tal causa voler, pus says non la pots haver. *Cf.* Tous 29: no ames tal cosa haver, / pus saps que⁵ no la pots haver.
- [20] No llesves trigo al molino do se compra el pan y el vino. Catal. R. L. Guarde no ports blat al moli, on hom empre el pa e el vi. *Cf.* Tous 155: guarde no ports blat al molí / hon hom ampra⁶ lo pa y el vi.
- [21] No te despidas de quien te puede hazer [*corrected to:* uenir] gran bien. Catal. R. L. Not vulles de home partir de qui gran bet pusca venir. *Cf.* Tous 147.
- [22] No seas tan resabido que otrie quede corrido. Catal. R. L. Non sies tan fort ensenhat, quel altre ne sia blasmat. *Cf.* Tous 53: no sies tan fort enseñat⁷ / que l'altro ne sia blasmat.
- [23] No quieras, si eres discreto, de nadie saber secreto. Catal. R. L. No vulles a tal demanar, la causa questa a celar. *Cf.* Tous 131.
- [24] No te haga hypocresia gemir ni ayunar un dia. Catal. R. L. Guardet not fassa dejunar, hypocresia ni plorar. *Cf.* Tous 174.
- [25] No seas facil a ofrecer lo que no puedes hazer. Catal. R. L. No ams a home proferir de fe que no li pots cumplir. *Cf.* Tous 39.
- [26] No respondas al ayrado, ni te escuses al malvado. Catal. R. L. No [*deleted*] No partes ab home airat, nit escuses a home malvat. *Cf.* Tous 74.
- [27] 85r No oyas sermon de quien obra mal y dize bien. Catal. R. L. No uulles de home auzir sermo que fassa lo mal el be no. *Cf.* Tous 79.
- [28] No alabes señor ni Rey que por oro rompe ley. Catal. R. L. No uulles aquell Rey llauser, que per dines deixa iustiar. *Cf.* Tous 83.
- [29] No alabes tu palafren a quien de nadie dize bien. Catal. R. L. No llous ton cauall ni ton astor a home gran scarnidor. *Cf.* Tous 81.
- [30] 87v: No repous en sendero que tiene mal paradero. R. Lull. No uulles repaus en cama [*sic*] on treball na ha bona fi. *Cf.* Tous 11: no vulles repós en camí / hon treball no ha bona fi.

5. *que* supplied by editor.

6. See Tous's note.

7. See Tous's note.

- [31] 87v: No procuraras uengarte de quien puede al doble honrarte. Catal. ex R. Lull. Not vulles de home uengar, quet puga ta honra dotblar. *Cf.* Tous 23.
- [32] 87v: No alojés en la posada do alguno de ti mal habla. Catal. ex Ray. Lull. No uulles posar en hostel em [*sic*] que hom diga de tu mal. *Cf.* Tous 20.
- [33] 87v: No des tu puñal prestado a quien la capa has hurtado. Catal. R. L. No [*corrected from non*] vulles prestar ton coltell a cel qui has tolt mantell. *Cf.* Tous 126.
- [34] 95r: Piensa a menudo que haras porque no te halles atras. Catal. ex Ray. Lull. Sovin consira que faras, per po [*sic*] que non cagas al pas. Sovent considera que faras / per so que no caygues al pas. *Cf.* Tous 16. The annotator misreads 'ço' as 'po'.
- [35] f. 102v: Quando el pensamiento uiene, mira bien si buen fin tiene. Catal. Ex. R. Lull. Sit ue null pensar pelagri ueges si ve a bona fi. *Cf.* Tous 7.
- [36] Quanto a este mundo te acercas, tanto del otro te alejas. Catal. R. L. Si daqueste mon fas ton amich, laltre mon faston enemich. *Cf.* Tous 18.
- [37] 102v: Quando uas la noche al lecho, piensa al dia lo que mal has hecho. Catal. R. L. La nuit quant entraras en llit memorat que has al jorn fallit. *Cf.* Tous 26.
- [38] 107v: Quien cura mucho el pellejo, a uicios haze aparejo. Catal. ex. Ray. Lull. Aquell quis mira son talo, nos fa de uirtuts companio. *Cf.* Tous 22.
- [39] 107v: Quien uil menester aprende, poco bien hazer entiende. Catal. R. L. Aquell qui apren uil mester, ab eyll non pora gran be fer. *Cf.* Tous 172.
- [40] 111v: Quien la honra aqui procura, en infierno havra locura. Catal. ex R. L. Cel qui aci acquer honor, en infern aura deshonor. *Cf.* Tous 9: çell qui a si aquer honor / en infern haurá deshonor.
- [41] 119v: Si peso te echas a cuestras hale tal que subas cuestras. Catal. ex. Ray. Lull. Lo faix quet uols carregar fel tal quel puscas luens portar. *Cf.* Tous 15.
- [42] 119v: Si hablares con tu señor hazle en tu habla honor. Catal. R. L. Quant parlaras dauant senyor, ab ton parlar le fe honor. *Cf.* Tous 122.
- [43] 119v: Sabio es quien el mal sostiene y mas quien el bien retiene. Catal. R. L. Sauí es cel quel mal sap sofrir, e mais que al be sap retenir. *Cf.* Tous 94.
- [44] 119v: Si amas siempre lo que deues, no temas quel pecar poruenes [*sic*]. Catal. ex. R. Lull. Si uols mais so que Deus [*sic*] amar, en nulla re poras pecar. *Cf.* Tous 12: si vols mes so que deus amar, / en nulla re porás peccar.
- [45] 119v: Si en eterno quies [*sic*] biuir este siglo has de aborrrir. Catal. ex. Ray. Lull. Si tu uols per tostemps uiuir aqueste mon fas ton enemich. *Cf.* Tous 17: si tu vols per tots temps vivir, / aquest mon hages en air.
- [46] 120r: Si te amenazare alguien, mira quanta fuerça tien. Catal. R. L. Aquell quit amanassara, consira quanta forsa ha. *Cf.* Tous 78.
- [47] 120v: Si quieres ser tuyo entero, seras todo de dios primero. Catalanus. Si tu uols asser de tu teu primerament sies de Deu. R. Lull. *Cf.* Tous 5.
- [48] 124r: Tendras de peccar recato como el raton teme al gato. Catal. ex R. Lull. Ay tant com lo rat tem lo gat, ages paor de far peccat. *Cf.* Tous 8.

[49] 124r: Ten tu punto en quanto vales con tus bienes naturales. Catal. ex R. Lull. Ay tant uulles ualer quanto [*sic*] uals segons los teus bens naturals. Cf. Tous 10.

Where did our man find his Lull? He can only have known the text of Lull in manuscript, as the *Proverbis d'ensenyament* were first printed by Morel-Fatio in 1882. The manuscript tradition of the *Proverbis* is extremely poor: there are only two manuscripts, both in the Ambrosiana in Milan. Both are of the sixteenth century and both come from the library of the Italian Humanist Gian Vincenzo Pinelli (1535-1601). Morel-Fatio (1882: 191) pointed to Castilianisms in spelling. The Spanish proverbs are not found elsewhere and seem to be a translation from the Catalan. This parallels Hand 1's addition of Spanish translations to the French and Italian of Corrozet.

CONCLUSIONS

This study has taken in only a small sample of the annotations. The *Refranes* is a good example of print as a home for manuscript. Joseph Scaliger (1540-1609) wrote:

I never used a lexicon except a simple one, and not to look up words, but to add to it words that I had read (Blair 2010: 245).

It reminds us that at least in this case the added proverbs came from written rather than oral sources, printed or (in the case of Lull) manuscript. In fact, by collecting additional proverbs from printed sources our annotator is continuing the methodology of Hernán Núñez himself.

And, last but not least, this copy is interesting for the textual history of Lull's *Proverbis d'ensenyament*: although Francisco López does not bring any significant readings, he is a witness that someone was reading the *Proverbis* in manuscript well before the princeps of 1882.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- BLAIR, ANN (2010). *Too Much to Know: Managing Scholarly Information before the Modern Age*, New Haven: Yale UP.
- BLAKEWAY, Amy (2011). "The Library Catalogues of Sir Hans Sloane: Their Authors, Organization, and Functions", *eBLJ*, 2011, art. 16, <<http://www.bl.uk/eblj/2011/articles/pdf/ebljarticle162011.pdf>>.
- CHALMERS, Alexander (1815). *The General Biographical Dictionary*, London: J. Nicols.
- COMBET, Louis *et al.* (2001). *Hernán Núñez, Refranes o proverbios en romance* (ed.), Madrid: Guillermo Blázquez.
- CORROZET, Gilles (1550). *Bonne réponse à tous propos ... traduit d'Italien en nostre vulgaire françois ... Brefve addition d'aucuns autres proverbes sententieux, communs par toute Italie...*, Paris: par Gilles Corrozet.
- FAIRBANKS, Alfred & DICKINS, Bruce (1962). *The Italic Hand in Tudor Cambridge*, Cambridge: Cambridge Bibliographical Society.
- GALLAGHER, John (2007). "The Italian London of John North: Cultural Contact and Linguistic Encounter in Early Modern England", *Renaissance Quarterly*, 70, pp. 88-131.
- JAURALDE, Pablo (dir.) (2008). *Biblioteca de autógrafos españoles, I (siglos XVI-XVII)*, Madrid: Calambur.
- KOPPELMANN, George & WECHSLER, Daniel (2015). *Shakespeare's Beehive: An Annotated Elizabethan Dictionary Comes to Light*, 2nd ed., New York: Axletree Books.
- MADROÑAL, Abraham (2002). "Los Refranes o proverbios en romance (1555), de Hernán Núñez, Pinciano", *Revista de Literatura*, 64, pp. 5-40.
- MELLINGHOFF-BOURGERIE, Vivianne (2011). "François de Sales et l'automne de la Renaissance", in *Rencontres autour de St François de Sales*, Thonon: Académie Chablaisienne, pp. 15-38.
- MOREL-FATIO, Alfred (1882). "Proverbes rimés de Raimond Lull", *Romania*, 11, pp. 188-202.
- NUÑEZ, Hernán (1555). *Refranes, o Proverbios en romance que nueuamente colligió y glossò el Comendador Hernan Nuñez ...; Van puestos por la orden del Abc ...; Van tambien aqui añadidas unas coplas, hechas a su muerte ...*, Salamanca: en casa de Iuan de Canova, 1555 (BL, 635.l.11).
- ROSENTHAL, Bernard M. (1997). *The Rosenthal Collection of Printed Books with Manuscript Annotations: A Catalog of 242 Editions mostly before 1600 Annotated by Contemporary or Near-Contemporary Readers*, New Haven: Yale University.
- Sloane Database: <<http://www.bl.uk/catalogues/sloane/>>.
- TAYLOR, Barry (1999). "Michael Verinus and the *Distichs of Cato* in Spain", in *Latin and vernacular in Renaissance Spain*, ed. Barry Taylor and Alejandro Coroleu, Manchester: Dept of Hispanic Studies, pp. 73-82.

- Tòus Prieto, Francesc (2016). “‘Cascun proverbi és escrit / per ço que en son lloc sia dit’: els proverbis rimats de Ramon Llull”, *Mot So Razo*, 15, pp. 69-84.
- Tòus Prieto, Francesc (2018). Ramon Llull, *Mil proverbis; Proverbis d’ensenyament*, NEORL, 15, Palma: Patronat Ramon Llull.
- Verino, Michele (1987). *Distichorum liber*, ed. Catalina Terrasa Montaner, Palma: Conselleria d’Educació i Cultura del Govern Balear.
- Woudhuysen, H. R. (2014). “Review of first edition of Koppelman & Wechsler 2015”, *Times Literary Supplement*, 22-29 August, pp. 28-29.